Program Report to Lilly Endowment
July 2014

Grantee: Private Academic Library Network of Indiana (PALNI)
7606 W 450 N
Sharpsville, IN 46068

Grant Number: 2013 0664-000
Purpose: Study of library print collection to reduce duplication and optimize space
Grant Amount: $225,000
Grant Period: October 1, 2013 – June 30, 2015
Period Covered: October 1, 2013- June 30, 2014

Introduction
The Lilly Endowment granted $225,000 to the Private Academic Libraries Network of Indiana (PALNI) in support of a Shared Print Collections Study in partnership with the Academic Libraries of Indiana (ALI). Thirty-six ALI libraries, including all twenty-three PALNI libraries, chose to participate in the study (Appendix A).

The goals of the study are
1. to provide participating libraries an opportunity to reduce their print collections with minimal impact on library users;
2. to allow participating libraries to reclaim space for other purposes more directly beneficial to library users;
3. to identify unique print items within the collections of participating libraries for preservation and potential digitization;
4. to inform and influence ongoing collection development at the individual libraries; and
5. to develop a statewide strategy for print book collections, which may involve cooperative purchasing.

Project Timeline
October 2013: Introductory meeting held
November 2013: SCS and Project Coordinator contracts finalized; Policy Group formed
December 2013: Data questionnaires submitted to SCS
January 2014: Data sets submitted to SCS
February 2014: Policy Group meeting
March 2014: Policy Group meeting
April-May 2014: SCS sent individual library data summaries
May 2014: SCS provided group data summary for use by the Policy Group; Policy Group meeting
June-July 2014: SCS loaded individual library data into its online collection analysis tool; Participant meetings held to provide training for the online tool

Project Timeline Narrative
An introductory meeting was held in October 2013, following which work began to establish the infrastructure for supporting the project. PALNI negotiated contracts with Sustainable Collections Services, a library consulting firm with the capacity to analyze the bibliographic and circulation data of the thirty-six participating libraries, as well as a Project Coordinator from within the participating
libraries to maintain communication and shepherd the project to completion. These contracts were finalized in October and November 2013 in keeping with the proposed project timeline.

From December 2013 to February 2014, the Project Coordinator worked to gather both data questionnaires and data sets from the participating libraries. The participating libraries submitted over five million records for analysis. After filtering out a minimal amount of data for various reason (i.e. out of project scope), SCS analyzed 5,184,492 records. These records represent 2,141,984 distinct titles showing that there is indeed a great deal of duplication across the collections of participating libraries. However, of the 2,141,984 distinct titles, 1,185,427 are held by just one participating library. So while copies of many titles are held by multiple participating libraries, there is also a large body of titles that are unique to one library within the group. Interestingly, no title is owned by all thirty-six libraries. The most widely-held title is owned by thirty-four of the thirty-six libraries.

Once all data was submitted to SCS, the consultants normalized and analyzed the data. In May 2014, SCS sent a data summary to each library for review. Following confirmation from individual libraries, SCS combined the individual data sets into a group database and produced a group summary that could be used by the Policy Group in decision making.

Due to the number of participants, a representative twelve-member Policy Group was formed (Appendix B). This group was constituted in November 2013 in preparation for decision making that would be required in early 2014. The Policy Group met four times over the course of spring 2014 and engaged in further discussions over email to make several key decisions including the selection of libraries and groups of libraries to which the participant libraries’ collections would be compared (February 2014). The comparators chosen include the following.

**Libraries and Library Groups for Comparison:**
- Indiana University Bloomington
- Purdue University
- University of Notre Dame
- Committee on Institutional Cooperation (CIC) libraries (Big Ten)
- Top four interlibrary loan partners of each participating library

The Policy Group also decided against formal retention commitments in light of the time and staff this would require. Instead, they established an informal agreement to retain titles defined as scarcely-held at this time (March 2014). In May 2014, the group deliberated what criteria would be used to define a title as scarcely-held and agreed upon the following.

**Scarcely-Held Criteria:**
- Held by fewer than four libraries in Indiana;
- Held by fewer than twenty libraries in the US; or
- Not held by at least one of Indiana University Bloomington, Purdue University, or University of Notre Dame.

These criteria protect 1,702,592 items, or 33% of the shared collection, and make 3,481,900 items available for withdrawal. Of the protected items, there are 27,348 (1%) titles where a participating library owns the only copy in the US and 417,727 (8%) titles where a participating library owns the only copy in Indiana. The established criteria also ensure that a minimum of one copy of all titles remains in
the state of Indiana as part of one of the three large research library collections, providing quick and reliable access thank to established reciprocal resource sharing agreements and the statewide courier service managed by the Indiana State Library.

By the end of June 2014, SCS was able to produce a list of scarcely-held titles for each participating library and load withdrawal candidates for each library in GreenGlass, its online collection analysis tool. A day-long, in-person participant meeting was held on July 8, 2014, to provide an overview of the data and GreenGlass training. An abbreviated version of this meeting was offered virtually on July 16, 2014, for those unable to attend the in-person meeting.

The entire project to date has been executed ahead of the original timeline proposed.

Next Steps
At this time, all participating libraries have access to their data through SCS' online collection analysis tool. This tool allows libraries to develop local withdrawal criteria and create lists of withdrawal candidates. Several libraries have already begun the withdrawal process, but it is anticipated that it will take most libraries one to two years to complete withdrawal projects and reclaim stacks space for other purposes that are more directly beneficial to library users.

It is not anticipated that all withdrawal candidates will be removed due to other factors such as usage. Should the participating libraries choose to remove even a third of withdrawal candidates from their collections, they would reclaim approximately 58,032 square feet of space. This figure is higher than that estimated in the original grant proposal of 51,847 square feet.

The manner in which scarcely-held titles are managed is also up to the individual library. While there is an informal agreement to retain titles from this list at this time, some libraries may choose to make more formal commitments to these materials. IUPUI University Library, for instance, intends to identify titles that are truly rare and record its commitment to retain these titles in OCLC (Online Computer Library Center), the international database of library holdings. The criteria for this have yet to be established, but will include titles for which IUPUI University Library is the only holding library at the global, US, and state level at a minimum (787 titles). Libraries may also choose to undertake special preservation activities on scarcely-held items and to digitize titles that are free of copyright restrictions. ALI as a whole may also pursue a digitization effort as part of a future project.

The data analysis provided by SCS has given participating libraries the tools to achieve the first four goals described in the introduction and will inform future discussions amongst the PALNI and ALI member libraries regarding shared collections. The Project Coordinator will be gathering information regarding library actions as a result of the study throughout the coming year to provide evidence of the achievement of the project goals. Additionally, participating libraries will be surveyed on their experiences and perceived benefits of the project.
Appendix A

PALNI Libraries:
1. Anabaptist Mennonite Biblical Seminary
2. Ancilla College
3. Anderson University
4. Butler University
5. Christian Theological Seminary
6. Concordia Theological Seminary
7. DePauw University
8. Earlham College
9. Franklin College
10. Goshen College
11. Grace College and Theological Seminary
12. Hanover College
13. Huntington College
14. Manchester University
15. Marian University
16. Oakland City University
17. University of Saint Francis
18. Saint Joseph’s College of Indiana
19. Saint Meinrad Seminary and School of Theology
20. Taylor University
21. Trine University
22. University of Indianapolis
23. Wabash College

ALI Libraries:
24. Indiana State University
25. Indiana University Kokomo
26. Indiana University Northwest
27. Indiana University Southeast
28. Indiana University-Purdue University Fort Wayne
29. Indiana University-Purdue University Indianapolis University Library
30. Indiana University-Purdue University Indianapolis, Ruth Lilly Medical Library
31. Indiana University-Purdue University Indianapolis, School of Dentistry Library
32. Purdue University Calumet
33. St. Mary’s College
34. St. Mary-of-the-Woods College
35. University of Southern Indiana
36. Valparaiso University
Appendix B

Policy Group Members:
Marla Baden (IPFW)
Tina Baich (IUPUI) [replaced Robin Crumrin as IU libraries rep May 2014]
Dan Bowell (Taylor)
Robin Crumrin (IUPUI) [resigned from group due to job change May 2014]
Suzanne Hinnefeld (St. Mary's)
Nancy Kirkpatrick (Marian)
Jill Lichtsinn (Manchester)
Julie Miller (Butler)
Rick Provine (DePauw)
Donna Resetar (Valparaiso)
Greg Youngen (ISU)
Kirsten Leonard (PALNI, Contract/Fiscal Oversight)
Tina Baich, Project Coordinator